

2016

International cooperation for implementation of the
WHO FCTC Art.17- Economically sustainable
alternatives to tobacco growing
Report of the study visit in Nova Trento,
Leoberto Leal e Florianopolis/SC
Brazil



National Commission for the WHO
Framework Convention on Tobacco Control
Implementation
National Cancer Institute (INCA)
Ministry of Health / Brazil
March 28-30,2016

BACKGROUND

Brazil is one of the key facilitators of the International GT Articles 17 and 18 of the FCTC. This group was created in 2006 during the 1st Conference of the Parties (COP 1), as a study group status and at COP3 it acquired the status of Working Group.

One of the commitments made by Brazil at COP 5, was to hold the fourth meeting of the WG 17&18 to fulfill this mandate to COP6. This meeting took place in Pelotas in Rio Grande do Sul between 1st – 3rd October, 2013 in order to provide a methodological framework for the implementation of Articles 17 and 18. At the time, participated in this meeting delegations from 20 countries to meet and discuss the experience of Brazil and the implementation of its diversification program in Tobacco Cultivated Areas.

Upon the success of this meeting in Brazil, during the WHO FCTC / UNDP meeting on the Triangular South-South Cooperation, held in October 2015 in Montevideo, Uruguay, it was demanded to Brazil to host a visit study to understand the actions of the National Diversification program for the implementation of FCTC Art. 17 (Annex I).

The Triangular South-South cooperation is in line with the activities of the Working Group on sustainable measures to strengthen implementation of the Convention created at the fifth COP meeting in 2012, which, among other things, should review existing tools and assistance mechanisms, identify and recommend best practices to access international resources through bilateral and multilateral cooperation.

The purpose of the study visit was to demonstrate the actions developed in the framework of innovation for diversification in tobacco growing areas, based on the experiences of Brazil over the past 15 years and on the livelihoods methodology adopted at COP 6 in Russia. This methodology is being implemented in the Technical Assistance and Rural Extension (ATER) public call for diversification, by the Ministry of Agrarian Development under the responsibility of the Innovation and Methodology Coordination, Department of Family Agriculture and Department of Technical Assistance and Rural Extension (CIM/SAF/DATER).

The event was funded by the FCTC / UNDP secretariat and had the participation of three countries, namely: Jamaica, the Philippines and Uruguay. It was organized by the Brazilian Ministry of Agrarian Development and the Executive Secretariat of the National Commission for the Implementation of the WHO FCTC (CONICQ)/Brazilian Ministry of Health with technical support from Centre for Studies and Promotion of Group Agriculture (CEPAGRO).



DATE AND VENUE

The meeting took place from 28 to 30 March 2016 at the Hotel Majestic Palace, Florianópolis, Santa Catarina, Brazil.

Field visits took place in the municipalities of Nova Trento and Leoberto Leal/ SC, where the Ministry of Agrarian Development has diversification of activities in partnership with the Center for Studies and Promotion of Group Agriculture (CEPAGRO) since 2005, when Brazil ratified the Framework Convention and the National Program of Diversification in Areas of Tobacco Cultivation.

Florianópolis is the capital of Santa Catarina and is located at the south region of Brazil.

Santa Catarina is the second largest producer of tobacco in Brazil, accounting for 33% of national production.

The Santa Catarina's tobacco is exported to every continent, with 45% for European countries, 16% to Far East countries, 13% to North American countries, 7% for African countries and 5% for South American countries.

Nova Trento is a municipality in the state of Santa Catarina in the South region of Brazil.

Agriculture is the main economic activity with tobacco, corn, beans and grapes. The manufacture and marketing of colonial wine is an attraction that brings many tourists to Nova Trento. Is 85 km from Florianópolis and access is by dirt road.

Leoberto Leal is another municipality in the state of Santa Catarina, 156 km from Florianópolis that also have the agriculture as the main economic activity.

COMMENTED PROGRAM

March 28th, 2016

OPENING SESSION

1. List of government officials who were part of the opening session:

- WHO Framework Convention Secretariat Representative for Tobacco Control (FCTC)
- Executive Secretariat of the National Commission on Tobacco Control Implementation in Brazil (SE-CONICQ), chaired by the Minister of Health.
- Delegate of the Ministry of Agrarian Development of the State of Santa Catarina.
- Ministry of Foreign Affairs Representative
- Philippines' Department of Health Representative

- Jamaica's Development Ministry of Agricultural and Rural Representative
- International Cooperation Center for the Framework Convention on Tobacco Control in Uruguay Representative



PRESENTATIONS

Framework Convention on Tobacco Control and Implementation of Article 17 in the signatory countries – Convention Secretariat for the FCTC - Maria Carmen Audera-Lopez

2. The representative of the WHO Framework Convention Secretariat on Tobacco Control presented the importance of Article 17 of the FCTC to promote the provision of economically viable alternatives for tobacco growers, as this activity is characterized by the social disruption and poverty by unfair contractual form, child labor and exclusion from the market.
3. The tobacco industry interferes with the implementation of Articles 17 and 18 keeping the dependence of farmers using farmers' associations to develop strategies against tobacco control, exaggerating the financial benefits of tobacco growing and offering social responsibility actions seeking to build a positive company image and distract the government's attention and society about the real purpose of the company.
4. To strengthen the diversification policy, 10 effective strategies should be considered: promoting research; educational development and training programs for field workers and farmers; removing obstacles such as lack of resources and industry interference; maintain the cohesion between government sectors and mechanisms for funding; monitor industry strategies; prioritize the diversification program as government action; establish technical cooperation mechanisms for diversification; creation of information and collaborating centers; ensure the participation of civil society; and ensure protection of health, environment and social life for tobacco farmers in their regions.
5. International cooperation between the United Nations agencies such as the Food and Agriculture Organization, the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development and the World Bank should be strengthened.

The Importance of Article 17 in the context of the implementation of the FCTC in Brazil – SE-CONICQ - Tânia Cavalcante

6. The head of the Executive Secretariat of CONICQ presented that the implementation of the FCTC Art.17 has two important points: I. political and social commitment; II. tool to strengthen the FCTC Art.5.3.
7. The political and social commitment led to the National Program of Diversification in Areas of Tobacco Cultivation coordinated by the Ministry of Agrarian Development, one of the 18 members that make up the National Commission for Tobacco Control (CONICQ).
8. CONICQ is chaired by the Minister of Health and the National Cancer Institute (INCA) is its executive secretariat, whose attributions includes promoting the joints necessary for implementation of the FCTC and maintains the public health sector inserted into the National Program of Diversification in Areas of Tobacco Cultivation as stated in the National Plan for Combating Noncommunicable Diseases 2011-2022.
9. Tobacco growers are victims of the tobacco industry, as well as smokers. They need support to diversify tobacco cultivation.
10. Faced with a global drop in tobacco demand, tobacco producing countries need to accelerate the implementation of policy options recommendations to FCTC article 17 as a way to protect the livelihoods of tobacco growers.
11. The Article 17 implementation is a way to reduce the tobacco industry interference in tobacco control policy, which should be protected from the industry's interests.

Socio-economic reality of farmers producing tobacco - Department of Socioeconomic Rural Studies-DESER – Amadeu Bonato

12. The DESER coordinator presented systematic information from the characterization of the Family Production Units accompanied by Public Call for Technical Assistance and Rural Extension for Diversification of the Ministry of Agrarian Development based on records of 10,000 families in the South (Rio Grande do Sul, Santa Catarina and Parana).
13. The following data on families were identified: there is a predominance of European origin families, 50% of Germans; evident process of masculinization, with 52.6% of men that begins in youth; young families (33.4 years on average); with low education; and serious health problems such as back pain and vomiting in the harvest of tobacco.
14. The diversification process is directly related to access to land. The larger the area, the greater the level of diversification. Access to water is also essential for production.

15. Diversification allows increased family income and removes the grower from tobacco dependence chain.

Presentation of the experience of the Centre for Studies and Promotion of Group Agriculture - CEPAGRO and Thematic Network Diversification – Charles Lamb

16. The CEPAGRO mission is to promote agroecology in coordination networks between rural and urban communities ensuring political influence. Understanding that agroecology is characterized not only by the production of food without chemicals that can cause damage to the environment and human health, but mainly considering the farmer, the land, the product and the consumer as parts that interact and form an integrated and holistic cycle where well-being and social inclusion are the main objectives.
17. Integrates with other Brazil Organizations, the thematic network for diversification, taking the role of foster debate with society and farmers, provide information and influence through advocacy legislative bodies, giving implementation conditions of FCTC Article 17 & 18 and the necessary increase in the number of families to perform the transition to food crops, and / or other activities on alternatives to tobacco growing. Is linked to other sectors involved in the implementation of the treaty, especially the sectors related to the health area
18. Performs through projects with international cooperation and national partnerships, educational and organizational actions with the families to build smoking alternative plans, especially agroecology courses, exchanges between producers, technical visits and participation in events related to the FCTC. The family groups make up the Ecovida Agroecology Network, covering more than 200 municipalities in southern Brazil, with a network of NGOs, organizations of family farmers and consumers to develop training activities, exchanges, generation and dissemination of information, certification participatory networking and political-organizational coordination.

Presentation of the experience of the Centre for Support and Promotion of Agroecology - CAPA – Rita Surita

19. CAPA provides advice on social and political organization, training and economic production of farming families and fulfills the Public Technical Assistance Call and Rural Extension (ATER) for the Diversification of the Ministry of Agrarian Development.
20. CAPA's coordinator reported that the organization meets 7 municipalities, 1,200 units, where 50% are women, in addition to having other 10 partner organizations.

21. The ATER network works with: regular leaders of partner organizations and CAPA meetings; monthly technical staff meetings; technical and methodological staff training and financial support for partner organizations.
22. The main themes involves agroecology; cooperative organization; family agribusiness; marketing; social biodiversity; beekeeping; rescue and preservation of native seeds; promotion of health education, focusing on bioactive plants; healthy food and community health.

National Program of Diversification in Areas of Tobacco Cultivation and Methodological Matrix – MDA/SAF/DATER – Hur Ben Corrêa da Silva

23. The coordinator of the National Program for Diversification in Areas of Tobacco Cultivation of the Ministry of Agrarian Development presented the scenario of tobacco production in Brazil, which ranks second position worldwide. Exporting 87% of its production, is the world's largest tobacco exporter.
24. The diversification program of tobacco growing was a condition to ratify the Framework Convention on Tobacco Control in 2005 and aims to support the implementation of ATER's projects, training and research to develop productive diversification strategies for tobacco growers, seeking new opportunities for income and better quality of life.
25. Public policies to overcome the program's challenges involve access to credit, institutional market, technical assistance and rural extension (ATER), organization, value addition and infrastructure.

Presentation of a family farmer experience - Edgar Guginski and Work Cooperative and Rural Extension Terra Viva (COOPTRASC) - Rozane Gonçalves/Paula Ferreira

26. The farmer Edgar Guginski, from Santa Catarina, still grows tobacco, but is now diversifying his crops, obtaining income from planting strawberry and grape and jelly production. He also began to promote rural tourism activities. He said he does not like to plant tobacco, and prefers to plant foods, such as strawberries and beans. He added saying that in the past he planted tobacco because he had no alternative. Today, he has more revenue with strawberry than with tobacco. He has received many visits from other tobacco growers to know what he has done and how they can also get out of tobacco growing.
27. Rozane and Paula, COOPTRASC's techniques, are responsible for assisting Mr Edgar's property and demonstrated that the method of planting of strawberries follows the suspension production system where the plants are placed in suspended beds, in high plastic tunnels without contact the ground in tubular plastic bags (slabs) containing substrate.

28. The water supply and nutrients goes through nutrient solutions applied through irrigation with drip irrigation system.

Presentation of a family farmer experience – Stefani Becker and Central Cooperative for Technology Development and Information (COOPERTEC) - Aline Duarte

29. Stefani Becker agriculture represented her family that currently is dedicated to the production of organic fruit and also disregards return to tobacco planting. Today they are no longer exposed to the plantation poisons and have a better quality of life.
30. The cooperative works in partnership with the Department of Family Agriculture of the Ministry of Agrarian Development (SAF / MDA) and aims to strengthen and qualification of Technical Assistance and Rural Extension (ATER) for Family Agriculture in the states of Rio Grande do Sul, Santa Catarina and Paraná. There are 14 consultants and 120 technicians who are following and developing projects for about 11 thousand families of farmers.
31. It has the active participation of youth and women and uses participatory methodologies based on the assessment of the farmers' needs. One purpose of the program is to promote the convergence to the Framework Convention on Tobacco Control (FCTC) and articulate the principles of the ATER National Policy (PNATER).

Incentive of Public Policies in the Diversification Program - Institutional Market Trading (National School Feeding Programme (PNAE), Food Acquisition Program (PAA)) and Presentation of the Cooperative Coordination – MDA/SAF/DEGRAV- Marcelo Piccin

32. The Department of Income Generation and Added Value's (DEGRAV) Director presented the importance and context of family farming, also known as peasant, within the production perspective, in areas up to 70 hectares, characterized by the use of their own family labor, and as the group establishing an agribusiness resistance ratio.
33. The diversification of agricultural production is essential, mainly associated with policies to support and promote family farming, in the sense that also promotes food security and sovereignty of a people. However, pointed out that one of the main incentives for diversification is to unlatch the links that hamper market access.

March 29th, 2016

FIELD VISIT TO NOVA TRENTO AND LEOBERTO LEAL IN SANTA CATARINA

34. In Nova Trento / SC, the group visited Mr. Alcides Will's property in Rio Veado community, 83 km away from capital of Santa Catarina, Florianópolis. He and his five children are in organic farming and marketing logistics.

When asked if he would return to growing tobacco replied, "No!" Categorically. The farmer points out that the current job is lighter. No longer have to work late at night, or stay in the burning of wood. And that



instead of making the harvest, which depending on the weather can damage the crop of tobacco, makes money every week. Using greenhouses to produce different species of vegetables highlighted the lettuce production where with the protected cultivation of this species can grow up to 2.4 million units, R\$ 1 each, collecting 30 in 30 days healthy food with sale guaranteed.

35. Also in Nova Trento / SC, the group visited the agribusiness Conservas Will Ltda, owned by the brothers Will, which produces canned food and jellies with organic and conventional products from the farmers around. There was heard the testimony of Carla Will, Alcides Will's



daughter: "Who plant tobacco is addicted, just as those who smoke cigarettes. It is the addiction to see the money at once, when you sale. But after paying the costs of production, just little remains from all this "

36. In Leoberto Leal, the group visited Mr Gilmar Cognaco's property that began the transition from



tobacco cultivation to produce agroecological food in 2005, participating in exchanges and training activities in diversified production and grassroots organization along with other farm families of the region. He and his family were so pleased with the results, which, since 2007, already work only in the cultivation of organic products (fruits and vegetables, jelly and grape juice). Today, as part of a network called 'Ecovida Agroecology Network', they integrate with other 20 families who work in the production and sale

of organic products. At the beginning, it was very hard to think of how he could sell what they produce, after all, with tobacco, he already knew how to resell and more or less as it could render the end of a harvest. Today, and in coordination with other members of Ecovida groups, he and other partner's farmers sell their products directly in open fairs, Central Supply and Commercialization (CEASA), local markets and schools. With organic, he never has losses, or it is very insignificant. What is left over, they consume themselves in their homes, said the producer.

37. Mr Gilmar also registered the importance of the government project to prioritize organic food in schools, which is very good because it guarantees a market for producers and make sure that children are eating food without poison. "Everyone who works with poison in production often uses highly toxic products that can be even banned in Brazil - as glyphosate. This is very bad for health, we see more and more growers getting sick of cancer and other diseases" He said.



March 30th, 2016

SCENARIOS OF TOBACCO GROWING IN VISITORS COUNTRIES AND REFLECTIONS ON THE BRAZILIAN MODEL

10

Uruguay – International Cooperation Center for the Framework Convention on Tobacco Control - Emilio Toma/Amanda Sica/Ema Camacho

38. The representatives stated that tobacco farmers in Uruguay still do not understand the damage from tobacco cultivation, and there are no regulations for the protection of children, which are used as labor, and also there are no networks to support diversification in tobacco cultivation.
39. They explain that the industry appropriates social responsibility to maintain the dependence of tobacco farmers, which is high.
40. There are small and organic crops in selective high-income areas.
41. They also note a serious situation related to areas of the Uruguayan government, which are still stimulated to tobacco production.
42. They consider very important to work the perspective of health with an intersectoral approach to health risks for the tobacco producer.

Philippines – Department of Agriculture–Wilma Ibea/Jennifer Remoquillo - Department of Labor and Employment-Maria Lourdes Gonzales - Department of Agrarian Reform-Lawrence Cruz - Department of Health-Myrna Cabotaje/Maria Cristina Galang

43. The Department of Agriculture representative presented the tobacco production scenario in the Philippines stating that it is widely cultivated and one of the main agricultural income in the Philippines after rice.
44. To the present date, tobacco is grown in 23 provinces, covering approximately 33,000 hectares with a production of about 56,193 MT.
45. The production is represented by four types of tobacco: Virginia, Burley, Turkish tobaccos (aromatic tobacco) and native tobacco.
46. Reflecting on the field visit, they realized the importance of connection between the farmers' products and the market, the government food programs; crop diversification observed in the properties; the training of farmers and their organizations; and the welfare and health of consumers.
47. As proposed alternatives, they identified the various agricultural activities (vegetables and seedling production); food processing; crafts and services.

48. They aim to promote a plan to make proposals to family farmers that include a feeding program in schools, in hospitals, for workers involving the responsible departments.
49. And also promote awareness and adoption of rules on the health risks related to tobacco; the participatory rural appraisal; an improvement program of crop production and other cultures; market access; management and production skills training; and technical and business assistance services.
50. The representative of the Philippines Department of Health noted that, unlike Brazil, most tobacco farmers of their country is set on land of large farmers as lessees. Therefore, considers that the articulation must involve the farmer and the owner.

Jamaica - Peter Thompson / Vaughn Barnaby - Rural Agricultural Development Authority (RADA)

51. The representative of Jamaica's Rural Agricultural Development Authority, highlight advances in tobacco control policies of their country. "We have had significant advances in smoking restrictions in closed collective environments and actions in schools, focusing on children and adolescents, so that they do not start smoking or working in cultivation. Now we are trying to work in the proposed Articles 17 and 18 of the FCTC".
52. Tobacco production in Jamaica in recent years fell 43%, because the industry began to import cigarette, instead of producing locally.
53. There are currently no organized marketing system for tobacco; large companies import cigarettes; growing illicit market and tobacco is not the main source of income for most farmers.
54. They realized by the Brazilian model that should be a level of commitment to diversify from tobacco growing to other crops. He noted the healthy relationship between farmers and extension agents, and that farmers realize that tobacco culture offered more health risks.
55. They also identified possibilities for implementing a school feeding program; rural tourism to agro-ecological areas; continuity in the current implementation of credit inclusion; development of a breeding program aimed at increasing production and productivity with market access; involvement of the movement to the Jamaica Organic Agriculture (Joam) and intensify educational campaigns. The challenge is to ensure profitability in the cultivation of food rather than tobacco. In this sense, trade could be a way out.
56. They also have an interest in adapting the survey conducted by the Ministry of Agrarian Development made with the families served by ATER presented by the representative of DESER.

CONCLUSIONS, RESULTS AND NEXT STEPS

57. Unanimously, the three countries have recognized the importance of stimulating organic production, as Brazil has done, worrying about the health of farmers and consumers.
58. The existence of public policies to meet the challenges of the program is critical to the farmer support and security to invest in another culture. It is understood by public policy: access to credit, access to institutional market, technical assistance and rural extension, organization of cooperatives of growers, value addition and infrastructure.
59. The promotion and sharing of best practices should focus future efforts to promote implementation of Articles 17 and 18.
60. The greatest challenge is to ensure profitability in food crops and other farm activities instead of the tobacco.
61. There was interest in the three countries to carry out some kind of research with the families of tobacco producers in the mold of the research presented by the representative of DESER and consultant of the Ministry of Agrarian Development. In this sense, the MDA could guide and provide the questions that guided the research and other relevant information.
62. The three countries that were at the meeting in the capacity of technical support recipients shall prepare and submit to their governments to account the experience and knowledge of Brazil and its intervention proposals in their countries.
63. This report was shared with Brazilian partners and the other two countries delegations that attended the meeting.
64. This report will also be forwarded to the Working Group on sustainable measures to strengthen implementation of the Convention will meet between 26 and 28 April 2016.
65. Reports relating to item 62 will be sent to the Working Group on sustainable measures to strengthen implementation of the Convention after the meeting that will take place in April, respecting the meetings schedule for COP7.
66. The entire meeting was recorded with photos and footage to produce a 10-minute film with subtitles in English and Spanish that can be presented in future events to promote the implementation of Articles 17 & 18 and encouraging pilot projects as determined at the Sixth Conference of the Parties, on the occasion of approval of the guidelines of these articles.
67. All the presentations, contact members and project tasks are available by Ecollab platform to everyone that attended the meeting in order to keep on the information exchange and cooperation.

CLOSURE OF MEETING



Annex I

SST – Project - Article 17 – Study Visit to Examine Brazilian Alternative Livelihoods

Title	Article 17 – Alternative Livelihoods					
Parties involved	Provider: Brazil Recipients: Jamaica, Philippines and Uruguay					
Triangular support (if any)	FCTC Secretariat as facilitator					
Output	Country-specific action plans for recipient countries to develop programs for alternative livelihoods, informed by Brazil's experiences over the last 15 years. Brazil's programs include 1) the promotion of broad sustainability among growers; 2) capacity-building for growing non-tobacco crops in more ecologically friendly ways; 3) linking former tobacco farmers as sellers of food crops to government food programs (school breakfasts and lunches); 4) placing alternative livelihoods within existing social programs (e.g. Bolsa Familia – conditional cash transfer program); and 5) building effective partnerships with non-governmental actors (e.g. civil society, academia) working toward successful alternative livelihoods.					
Type of Support	Situation Analysis	Training / Capacity Bldg X	Evidence	Technical Support (human) X	Tools X	Best practices generation X
Activities by category	<p>(Tasks to transform inputs into outputs)</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Brazil to supply background materials to three partner countries from their alternative livelihood programs (e.g. case studies, technical manuals, etc.). Some may require translation to English. 2) The four parties will develop an action plan for small delegations (approx. 3 persons each country) to travel to the south of Brazil for a study visit co-hosted by the Ministry of Agrarian Development and the Ministry of Health (including INCA). Prior to the visit, each of the visiting delegations will supply to Brazil a report on the context in their countries (e.g. description of the tobacco growing sector; social programs that might work as recipients of food; existing relevant agricultural programs, etc.). Team leaders will meet virtually in this planning stage. 3) The action plan will also be developed into a formal proposal to be submitted directly to the Ministry of Agrarian Development for their official endorsement. 4) Three-day site visit to south of Brazil (described above). 5) Each country team, in consultation with Brazil and the other two countries, will develop a proposal to submit to each of their governments for a program informed by Brazil's experiences and expertise. 					

Title	Article 17 – Alternative Livelihoods
Timeline	<p>2015 – Q4 – Review of documents; development of study visit action plan/agenda and proposal to Brazil’s Ministry of Agrarian Development. Submit proposal for approval.</p> <p>2016 – End of Q1/Beginning of Q2 – Site visit to southern Brazil</p> <p>2016 – Q2 – Each country team develops a proposal on alternative livelihood programs to submit to their government.</p>
Financing Required	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Translation costs of materials (fairly minimal) - Travel costs for each country delegation (3-5 persons each) – airfare, transportation in-country, accommodation, meals, translation during site visit. - Hosting costs for Brazilian team (Agrarian Development and Health) - Approximate TOTAL cost: \$75,000
Financing Source/s	- Brazil is offering to donate the time of their relevant ministry staff to plan and host the study visit.
Risks	- Political changes in any of the four countries (e.g. presidential elections in Philippines; change of ministers in all four countries, etc.).
Focal Points	<p>Brazil: Tania Cavalcante* from INCA will be the point person for the project (taniac@inca.gov.br) ; Diogo Alves (diogo.alves@saude.gov.br) will be the main contact at Ministry of Health; Ana Paula Teixeira (ana.teixeira@inca.gov.br)</p> <p>Philippines: Ivanhoe Escartin* (docescartin@gmail.com); Grace Fe Buquiran (gbuquiran.bihc@gmail.com); Karla Espinosa (mklespinosa@gmail.com)</p> <p>Jamaica: Sheryl Dennis* (Sheryladennis@yahoo.com)</p> <p>Uruguay: Ana Lorenzo* (lorenzo.ana@gmail.com); Amanda Sica (notabaco@urucan.org.uy); Elba Esteves (eesteves@fur.gob.uy)</p>